State of Hawaii Department of Education

INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN QUARTERLY UPDATE THROUGH MARCH 31, 2014



FOR AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING May 6, 2014

This report is prepared solely for the internal use of the Audit Committee and management of the State of Hawaii, Department of Education.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION	PAGE
Executive Summary (Quarter 3 of FY 2014)	1
Audit Plan Results Summary: January 1, 2014 through March 31, 2014	3
Observation Analysis of Completed Reports	4
Management Action Item Dashboard Summary	5
Management Action Item Dashboard Detail	7
Internal Audit Recommendations Status	17
Management Action Plan Completion Status	32



Executive Summary

Assurance Projects:

Leave Accounting Follow-Up Review

- Review completed. Report issued in January 2014 and presented to the Board in February 2014.
 - Overall review rating was unacceptable. There were four observations, three (3) with a high risk rating and one (1) with a moderate risk rating.

Payroll Review

• Review began in mid September 2013. Report will be issued April 2014.

Baseline Assurance Projects

• Internal Audit (IA) performed one (1) Local School Fund Audit and provided internal control consultation to various schools/offices during the Quarter.



Executive Summary (continued)

Consulting, Investigation and Other Projects:

Follow-Up Monitoring Based on Management Action Plans

 IA followed-up on management action plans to the observations noted in the completed reviews. (See Internal Audit Recommendation Status on pages 17 - 31)

Fraud & Ethics Hotline - Confidential Reporting Mechanism

• IA continued to assign and monitor allegations received from the Fraud and Ethics Hotline.

Baseline Monitoring Projects

• IA is currently performing the "*Non-Appropriated Local School Fund Cancelled Check Review Report*" for the period July 1, 2013- December 31, 2013 for each of the 15 complex areas. Report will be issued April 2014.

Investigations

• IA was heavily involved in several investigations during the Quarter.

Other Matters Impacting the Internal Audit Office during the Quarter

• IA continued to assist the external auditors in the "Annual Financial and Single Audit" for the period ending June 30, 2013.



Audit Plan Results Summary: January 1, 2014 through March 31, 2014

						FY 2	2014						Cumulative Hours			
DESCRIPTION	Jul	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	Budget	Actual	ETC	Variance
surance Projects (Approved)																
eHR Post-Implementation Review													420	242	-	(17
Student Information Privacy Review													490	408	-	(8)
Leave Accounting Follow-up Review													630	393	-	(23
Payroll Review					1								840	644	20	(17
Equipment and Fleet Maintenance Review													560	-	560	-
Baseline Assurance Projects ¹													500	667	350	51
Consulting, Investigations & Other																
Follow-Up Monitoring Based on Management Action Plans													350	62	40	(24
Fraud & Ethics Hotline - Confidential Reporting Mechanism					1								350	271	51	(2
ACL Audit Tool Development					1								750	245	-	(50
Internal Control & Operational Efficiency Consultation													400	308	340	24
Investigations													1,550	3,437	700	2,58
Baseline Monitoring Projects ²					1								1,000	524	80	(39
Reporting & Communication													400	197	80	(12
External, State, Legislative & Consultant Audit/Review Coordination													300	432	10	14
Other Administration including budget preparation, meetings													300	432	10	14.
and other													1,040	819	100	(12
Risk Assessment Re-evaluation & Audit Plan for FY 2015													950	1	549	(40
					•						Tota	I Hours	10,530	8,650	2,880	1,00
In Process Ocompleted – Final F <u>Key:</u> Budget - Original Approved Budget	Result	s Issu	ed			Origi	nal In	iterna	l Audi	t Plan		Est	imated [Date of Co	ompletic	on

¹Baseline Assurance Projects – Local School Fund Audits, P-Card Reviews, and other.

Variance - [(Actual + ETC) – Budget as Amended] = over / (under) budget as amended

Actual - Actual Hours Incurred Through March 31, 2014

ETC – Estimated Time to Complete

² Baseline Monitoring Projects – Special Project – Cancelled Check Validating Review, Annual Checklist, Monitoring, and other.



Observation Analysis of Completed Reports

Based on previously completed reports, we compiled a listing of common observations. Management is currently in the process of addressing these Department wide gaps.

		Common	Observation	S		
		Lack of Oversight & Monitoring	Lack of Policies & Procedures	Segregation of Duties	Insufficient Training	Lack of Compliance
	Leave Accounting Follow-Up Review	X ¹	х	x	x	X ¹
	Student Information Privacy Review					X ¹
led	Consolidated Report of Procurement Card (P-Card) Reviews	x			x	X ¹
s Issu	eHR Post-Implementation Review	x	х	x		
Reports Issued	Data Integrity Review - Student Enrollment	X ¹	х	X ¹	x	X ¹
uc.	Community School for Adults Consolidated Review Report	X ¹	x	X ¹	x	X ¹
	School Food Services Review	x	x	X ¹	X ¹	X ¹
	Casual Hire Personnel Recruitment, Hiring & Payroll Processes Review	X ¹	х	X ¹	х	X ¹
	Procurement & Contracting Process Review	X ¹			х	X ¹
	Leave Data & Timekeeping Process Review	X ¹	х	x	x	

¹ Observations were school level findings (not state office level findings).



Management Action Item Dashboard Summary

The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous issued reports as reported by management:

			coso c	ategory²		No. of Findings Ranked "High" Requiring		Completio	n Status ³		
Audit	Audit Rating ¹	Operational Findings	Financial Findings	Compliance Findings	Total Findings	Immediate Management Attention	Outstanding - Overdue	Outstanding - Not Overdue	Partially Completed	Completed	Contact
Leave Accounting Follow-Up Review (Issued January 2014)	Unacceptable	4	0	0	4	3	0	4	0	0	OHR Personnel Specialist & OFS Accounting Operations Specialist
Student Information Privacy Review (Issued October 2013)	Acceptable	2	0	1	3	0	0	0	3	0	Data Governance Director
Consolidated Report of Procurement Card (P-Card) Reviews (Issued August 2013)	Unacceptable	1	0	4	5	2	0	0	1	4	Accounting Operations Specialist
eHR Post-Implementation Review (Issued July 2013)	Acceptable	3	0	0	3	0	0	1	0	2	Personnel Management Branch Director
Data Integrity Review - Student Enrollment (Issued April 2013)	Marginal	4	0	1	5	4	0	0	5	0	School Process and Analysis Branch Director
School Food Services Review (Issued January 2013)	Unacceptable	6	0	1	7	3	0	1	6	0	School Food Services Director
Casual Hire Personnel Recruitment, Hiring & Payroll Processes Review (Issued November 2012)	Unacceptable	4	0	1	5	3	0	0	1	4	Personnel Management Branch Director
Procurement & Contracting Process Review (Issued July 2012)	Marginal	4	0	3	7	4	0	0	1	6	Procurement Director
Leave Data & Timekeeping Process Review (Issued March 2010)	Unacceptable	5	0	0	5	2	0	1	1	3	Accounting Director
TOTAL		33	0	11	44	21	0	7	18	19	Page 5



Management Action Item Dashboard Summary (continued)

¹ Audit Rating Definitions:

- Acceptable No significant deficiencies exist, while improvement continues to be appropriate; controls are considered adequate and findings are not significant to the overall unit/department.
- Marginal Potential for loss to the auditable unit/department and ultimately to the DOE. Indicates a number of observations, more serious in nature related to the control environment. Some improvement is needed to bring the unit to an acceptable status, but if weaknesses continue without attention, it could lead to further deterioration of the rating to an unacceptable status.
- Unacceptable Significant deficiencies exist which could lead to material financial loss to the auditable unit/department and potentially to the DOE. Corrective action should be a high priority of management and may require significant amounts of time and resources to implement.

² COSO Category Definitions:

- Operational Findings Audit finding relates to the effective and efficient use of the entity's resources.
- Financial Findings Audit finding relates to the preparation of reliable published financial statements.
- Compliance Findings Audit finding relates to the entity's compliance with applicable laws and regulations.

<u>3 Completion Status Definitions:</u>

- Completed– Audit finding was resolved as stated by management.
- Partially Completed –Audit finding was partially resolved as stated by management.
- Outstanding Not Overdue Audit finding has <u>not</u> been resolved <u>but</u> has <u>not</u> passed management's target date.
- Outstanding Overdue Audit finding has <u>not</u> been resolved <u>and has passed management's target date</u>.



Management Action Item Dashboard Detail

REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Leave Accounting Follow-Up Review (Issued January 2014)	4	3	0	4	0	0

Objectives:

1. To ensure that Management has adequately addressed and resolved the audit findings that resulted from the March 2010 Internal Audit "*Leave Data & Timekeeping Process Review*" and appropriately evaluated and implemented the recommendations from the June 2011 KMH LLP "*Form G-2 Process Improvement Review*."

2. Test a sample of employees within the selected schools and offices to ensure that data entered into the T&A system is accurate, timely and properly supported and approved.



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Student Information Privacy Review (Issued October 2013)	3	0	0	0	3	0
Objectives: 1. To dete	ermine inherent and residual pr	ivacy-related risks in the DOE				

- 2. To provide assurance on controls over privacy risks.
- 3. To verify adherence with a set of privacy standards or regulations.
- 4. To ensure compliance with the DOE's own privacy statement on the use, collection, retention, and protection of student information.



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Consolidated Report of Procurement Card (P- Card) Reviews (Issued August 2013)	5	2	0	0	1	4 (1 of 2 "High")

Objectives:

- 1. Ensure that required P-Card documentation was submitted to the Vendor Payment Section on a timely basis.
- 2. Review, evaluate and test the department's compliance with the P-Card procedures, policies and practices issued by the DOE OFS as well as the DOE Procurement and Contracting policies and procedures.
- 3. Identify opportunities to improve processes and practices for the DOE P-Card operations and share related recommendations.



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
eHR Post- Implemen- tation Review (Issued July 2013)	3	0	0	1	0	2
2. To ensu 3. To ensu 4. To ensu	ew, evaluate, and test the design ing module and employee transa ire that information captured is c ire that information generated is ire that access controls are imple ire that access controls are prope	ctions module. omplete and accurate. accurate, reliable, and timely. mented in accordance with polic		over input, processing a	nd output of the eHR s	system application



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Data Integrity Review – Student Enrollment (Issued April 2013)	5	4	0	0	5	0

Objectives:

1. To review, evaluate, and test the design and operating effectiveness of the DOE's Student Enrollment and Withdrawal process at the DOE schools.

2. To ensure that DOE schools are in compliance with the Student Enrollment and Withdrawal policies and procedures:

a. Ensure that enrollment and withdrawal forms are properly completed and retained

b. Ensure that student information is properly recorded into the student information system

c. Ensure that information for student enrollment and withdrawals are entered timely into the student information system

3. To evaluate the controls in place to determine the accountability measure of ensuring that student enrollment data is valid and reliable.

4. To determine if Student Enrollment and Withdrawal policies and procedures have been updated and communicated to the field.

5. To provide recommendations to improve and enhance the effectiveness and efficiency of the Student Enrollment and Withdrawal processes.



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
School Food Services Review (Issued January 2013)	7	3	0	1	6	0

Objectives

1. To review, evaluate, and test the design and operating effectiveness of the DOE's purchasing process at the school cafeterias.

- Ensure that there is adequate oversight of purchases •
- Ensure that there is accountability of purchases •
- Ensure purchases are reasonable and proper
- To evaluate the cafeteria's compliance with internal disbursement policies and procedures, and Federal and State laws, rules and regulations, where applicable. 2.
- To review, evaluate, and test the design and operating effectiveness of the DOE's collection process of school meal payments at the school offices. 3.
 - Ensure that there is accountability of collections ٠
 - Ensure that collections are properly recorded in the point of sale (POS) system •
 - Ensure that collections are deposited timely into the School Lunch Collection Account •
- To evaluate the school's compliance with internal collection policies and procedures when receiving school food payments. 4.
- 5. To review, evaluate, and test the design and operating effectiveness of the DOE's cafeteria staffing formula.
 - Ensure staffing recommendations are implemented ٠
 - Ensure data used to determine staffing is representative ٠
- 6. Provide recommendations to enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of school food service processes.



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Casual Hire	5	3	0	0	1	4
Personnel						(3 of 3 "High")
Recruitment,						
Hiring &						
Payroll						
Processes						
Review						
(Issued						
November						
2012)						

Objectives:

1. To review, evaluate, and test the design and operating effectiveness of the Department's recruiting and hiring process for casual hire personnel and the casual payroll process based on leading practices.

2. To ensure that the Department's Casual Hire Personnel and Casual Payroll policies and procedures have been updated and communicated to the field.

- 3. To ensure that the schools/offices are in compliance with the Department's Casual Hire Personnel and Casual Payroll policies and procedures:
 - Necessary paperwork has been collected from the employee
 - Employee's information is valid and has been inputted correctly in to the Casual Hire Personnel system
 - Employee has had the proper background check/fingerprinting prior to start date
 - Employee has met minimum qualifications for position prior to start date, if applicable to position (this would ensure that the proper pay rate/title are correct)



Objectives (continued):

- 4. To review, evaluate, and test the design and operating effectiveness of the Department's recruiting and hiring process for casual hire personnel and the casual payroll process based on leading practices.
- 5. To ensure that the Department's Casual Hire Personnel and Casual Payroll policies and procedures have been updated and communicated to the field.
- 6. To ensure that the schools/offices are in compliance with the Department's Casual Hire Personnel and Casual Payroll policies and procedures:
 - Necessary paperwork has been collected from the employee
 - Employee's information is valid and has been inputted correctly in to the Casual Hire Personnel system
 - Employee has had the proper background check/fingerprinting prior to start date
 - Employee has met minimum qualifications for position prior to start date, if applicable to position (this would ensure that the proper pay rate/title are correct)



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING – OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Procurement & Contracting Process Review (Issued July 2012)	7	4	0	0	1	6 (4 of 4 "High")

Objectives

1. Understand and evaluate the policies, procedures, practices, and controls related to the procurement process.

2. Evaluate DOE's compliance with internal purchasing policies and procedures and Federal and State laws, rules and regulations, where applicable.

3. Test the design and operating effectiveness of DOE's internal controls over procurement of goods and services:

a. Ensure that purchases and contracts are being processed in a timely manner, and

b. Ensure that procurement processes are properly monitored by responsible school/office administrators.

4. Provide recommendations to enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of the procurement and contracting process.



REPORT NAME	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER of "High" RECOMMENDATIONS REQUIRING IMMEDIATE MANAGEMENT ATTENTION	OUTSTANDING - OVERDUE	OUTSTANDING – NOT OVERDUE	PARTIALLY COMPLETED	COMPLETED
Leave Data & Timekeeping Process Review (Issued March 2010)	5	2	0	1	1	3 (1 of 2 "High")

Objectives:

- 1. Evaluate the design of the internal controls in place surrounding the leave data and timekeeping processes to ensure that the processes:
 - a. are efficient,
 - b. comply with applicable codes, policies, regulations, and contract requirements,
 - c. adequately maintain the integrity of data, and
 - d. mitigate risks associated with access rights and authority limits.
- 2. Understand and evaluate for clarity, consistency, and completeness; the processes and tools in place that help to ensure personnel have the appropriate skills and training (i.e., communication channels, available resources, etc.) to properly administer employee leave and time.
- 3. Review the timekeeping process for selected schools and offices to ensure consistency with prescribed procedures. Also, identify any practices for knowledge sharing purposes which are currently in place that may be beneficial to all departments.
- 4. Test a sample of employees within the selected schools and offices to ensure that data entered into the KRONOS system is accurate, timely and properly supported and approved.



Internal Audit Recommendation Status

Au	dit Comment		Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Leave Accounting Follow-Up Review, Is	ssued January 2014			OFS-A	ccounting Operations S OHR-Person	-
 Lack of current and accessible leave OHR, in conjunction with OFS, should align with the BU agreements, include different leave accounting rules. Cons as noted by KMH LLP in the "Form O creating policies and procedures for 1) maintaining an employee leave file for centralized location, along with contact changes to the policies should be update remains on one document. Employees Lotus Notes. Training should be given policies and procedures are updated. 	update leave policies and procedure employee responsibilities, and sumr ider using the Leave Accounting Re 3-2 Process Improvement Review." requiring sign-in sheets for all employees. Place all policies an information if timekeepers have qu ted directly on the SPs to ensure that can be notified that updates were n	es (i.e. SPs) that marize the eference Manual, ' Consider loyees and 2) id procedures in a mestions. Any at all information made via email or	(1)	December 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	
 Lack of oversight and monitoring a update their "Timekeeper Checklist" w adjustments. Performing periodic mon or CABMs. Consider enforcing a requ annually in accordance with the collect resources at the school/office level if the responsibilities. Consider developing a update their leave records on a timely Principals/Administrators and Timekee 	with reminders about LWOP proced itoring of leave records by Principal urement for Timekeepers to issue F tive bargaining contracts. Consider the timekeeper is unable to perform ccountability measures for schools/o basis or create payroll overpayment	lures and ls/Administrators Form 7s at least reviewing staffing their leave offices that do not	(1)	December 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	
Completed	Partially Completed	Outstanding – No	ot Overdue	e Outstar	nding - Overdue	



The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous reports issued.

	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Leav	ve Accounting Follow-Up Review, Issued January 2014 (continued)		OFS-A	ccounting Operations S OHR-Person	-
3.	Need for a stronger tone at the top and greater accountability at the school/office level. Management should perform periodic monitoring of leave records by Principals/Administrators or CABMs. Consider enforcing a requirement for Timekeepers to issue Form 7s at least annually in accordance with the collective bargaining contracts. Consider reviewing staffing resources at the school/office level if the timekeeper is unable to perform their leave responsibilities. Consider developing accountability measures for schools/offices that do not update their leave records on a timely basis and create payroll overpayments. Training to Principals/Administrators and Timekeepers to reinforce the rules, clarify inconsistencies/misunderstandings of the rules and to increase their awareness of common leave accounting findings.	(1)	December 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	
4.	Lack of Ownership, Monitoring and Accountability of the Leave Accounting Process. Assistant Superintendents should meet to discuss responsibilities of each office regarding leave policies, procedures and monitoring. Perform periodic monitoring and testing of leave records by CABMs. Consider enforcing a requirement for Timekeepers to issue Form 7s at least annually in accordance with the collective bargaining contracts. Consider developing accountability measures for schools/offices that do not update their leave records on a timely basis and create payroll overpayments. Training to Principals/Administrators and Timekeepers. Enforce proper segregation of duties for timekeepers and system administrators.	(2)	December 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	

Completed

Partially Completed

Outstanding – Not Overdue

Outstanding - Overdue



	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Stu	dent Information Privacy Review, Issued October 2013			Data Governan	ce Director
1.	Lack of understanding of privacy practices with third-party vendors by school staff. Management should provide guidance that is 'clear to all' on what constitutes a third-party vendor and provide examples of when consent forms are required and pursue feasibility of incorporating warnings or reminders within FMS for users processing purchase orders or small purchase contracts for specified Object Codes linked to related services. Standardized templates should be created for schools to complete/follow when contracting with those third-party vendors. Training should provided guidance to registrars, clerks, and SASAs on third party privacy practice requirements. Management should create a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) or a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with frequently used third-party vendors.	(2)	September 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
2.	 Procedures are not always followed at the DOE school/office level and required forms and supporting documentation are not completed and/or retained. Management should hold schools accountable for following proper procedures by expanding annual on-site monitoring and enforce the proper completion of forms. Periodic spot checks should be conducted by someone outside the schools. Management should clarify policies and procedures to cover steps to take when parents request to access student information. Training should be provided to registrars, account clerks, and SASAs regarding privacy guidelines. Management should create standardized templates for schools to complete and 'quick reference checklist' for schools to use as reference. Management should clarify the signing of FERPA forms. 	(2)	September 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
3.	Process inefficiencies resulting from unclear interpretation of 'opt out' forms. Management should clarify that complete distribution of opt out forms is not a requirement and that communication of annual notification of privacy rights is sufficient.	(3)	September 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
	Completed Partially Completed Outstanding – No	ot Overdue	e Outstan	nding - Overdue	D 10



	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Сот	nsolidated Report of Procurement Card ("P-Card") Reviews, August 2013		Ac	counting Operation	s Specialist
1.	P-Card program procedures are not always performed properly. Management should enforce the consequences as listed on their P-Card Policies and Procedures for failure to submit documents timely; and should provide continuous training to schools and offices. Continuous P-Card audits by IA should be performed. Administrators and their staff handling the P-Card reconciliations should attend a P-Card training before Vendor Payment issues the P-Card.	(1)	December 2014	Completed	✓ December 2013
2.	Procurement and Contracting policies and procedures are not always performed properly. Management should enforce the consequences as listed on their P-Card Policies and Procedures for failure to submit documents timely; provide continuous training to schools and offices; consider consolidating purchasing worksheets and Form 10B; as well as consider exempting travel purchases due to the duplicative process. Continuous P-Card audits by IA should be performed. Administrators and their staff handling the P-Card reconciliations should attend a P-Card training before Vendor Payment issues the P-Card.	(1)	December 2014	Partially Completed	December 2013
3.	Original receipts are not always submitted. Management should enforce the consequences as listed on their P-Card Policies and Procedures for failure to submit documents timely; and should provide continuous training to schools and offices. Continuous P-Card audits by IA should be performed.	(2)	December 2014	Completed	✓ December 2013
4.	Restricted purchases are made. Management should enforce the consequences as listed on their P-Card Policies and Procedures for failure to submit documents timely; and should provide continuous training to schools and offices. Continuous P-Card audits by IA should be performed.	(2)	December 2014	Completed	✓ December 2013
5.	Purchases are not always made using good practice or in the best interest of the Department. Management should enforce the consequences as listed on their P-Card Policies and Procedures for failure to submit documents timely; and should provide continuous training to schools and offices. Continuous P-Card audits by IA should be performed. Administrators and their staff handling the P-Card reconciliations should attend a P-Card training before Vendor Payment issues the P-Card.	(3)	December 2014	Completed	✓ December 2013
	Completed Partially Completed Outstanding – N	lot Overdu	e Outsta	nding - Overdue	



The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous reports issued.

	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
eHl	R Post-Implementation Review, Issued July 2013		Personnel	Management Bran	ch Director
1.	System and control weaknesses identified in the eHR system. Management should embed more edit routines into fields in the eHR system for applications. Information Technology management may also want to consider increasing server capacity if funds are available. Management already aware of the problem with Records and Transaction Section (RTS) clerks being able to edit their own records and it is currently on their list of edits/changes to fix.	(3)	January 2014	Completed	✓ March 2014
2.	Lack of proper monitoring over access controls. RTS should consider updating the "eHR Request Form" to include a section to write the type of access given and the expiration date of the access. RTS should also enforce the proper completion of forms. Employees and consultants with access to confidential information in eHR should update their "eHR Request Forms" whenever they move positions or no longer need the access. Management may also want to track temporary assignments in the DOE. System Administrators should document discrepancy report follow ups to include information such as "date followed up" and "action taken/not taken."	(2)	January 2014	Completed	✓ March 2014
3.	Lack of policies and procedures for monitoring System Administrators' activity for eHR. Office of Human Resources (OHR) should create a policy for monitoring System Administrator activity that includes job responsibilities, regulations to be followed, access rights, as well as proper controls such as sign-offs and approvals for any changes or updates to the system or data in the system.	(3)	July 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	

Completed

Partially Completed

Outstanding – Not Overdue

Outstanding - Overdue



	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Dat	a Integrity Review - Student Enrollment, Issued April 2013	S	chool Process	and Analysis Bran	ch Director
1.	Lack of oversight, monitoring, and accountability at the DOE school level. Management may consider: mandatory training for all staff handling student enrollment and withdrawal functions, a training module in the School Administrative Services Assistant (SASA) Academy related to Student Enrollment, periodic spot checks conducted by someone outside the schools, performance evaluations related to student enrollment and withdrawal functions and taking away overpaid funds during the second and third counts for schools with inaccurately recorded counts.	(1)	June 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
2.	Lack of current and comprehensive Student Enrollment and Withdrawal policies and procedures. Management may consider: updating and standardizing policies, procedures and forms for both student enrollment/withdrawal and proof of residency, centrally locating the policies, procedures and forms so they are accessible by all, training given to the field, periodically revisit and update policies and procedures for any changes, updating registrar's handbook and distribute a handbook to all schools.	(1)	December 2013 June 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014

Completed	Partially Completed	Outstanding – Not Overdue	Outstanding - Overdue	
				Page 22



	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Dat	a Integrity Review - Student Enrollment (continued)	S	chool Process	and Analysis Bran	ch Director
3.	Insufficient controls in the Student Enrollment and Withdrawal process. Management may consider: updating and standardizing policies, procedures, and forms to cover the entire process and address control weaknesses, centrally locating them, training given to the field, periodically revisit and update polices and procedures for any changes, updating registrar's handbook and distribute a handbook to all schools, develop a comprehensive definition of "enrollment," creating a training module in the SASA Academy, creating policies and procedures for segregation of duties and reviews conducted by DOE School Administrator.	(1)	June 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
4.	Procedures not performed at the DOE school level and required forms and supporting documentation are not completed and/or retained. Management may consider: mandatory training required for all staff handling these functions, a training module included in the SASA Academy, periodic spot checks by someone outside the schools, performance evaluations related to student enrollment/withdrawal functions, overpaid funds are taken away during the second and third counts, reviews are performed by school Administrators to ensure forms are properly completed and attendance is properly taken, and revising and updating policies and procedures for proof of residency, geographic exceptions, and transfers.	(1)	June 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
5.	Process inefficiencies where multiple forms serve the same purpose. Management may consider: updating policies and procedures, training to the field, consolidating "Student's Certificate of Release" Form 211 into one form, and either Form 211 or "Request for Release Form" should be eliminated as both serves the same purpose.	(3)	June 2014	Partially Completed	March 2014
	Completed Partially Completed Outstanding – N	ot Overdue	e Outstar	nding - Overdue	



The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous reports issued.

	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Sch	ool Food Services Review, Issued January 2013			School Food Servic	es Director
1.	Ownership of the food purchasing and meal payment collection processes is unclear. OFS and School Food Services (SFS) Branch should determine which branch owns these processes. Once ownership is determined, policies and procedures need to be updated. Management should determine who will make these updates, train the field, and monitor compliance.	(1)	July 2014	Partially Completed	September 2013
2.	Lack of oversight, monitoring and accountability of purchases. Management may consider: segregation of duties within the purchasing process, more efficient and user friendly communications of price list changes, mandatory training required for all staff handling these functions, and periodic spot checks should be conducted by someone outside the schools. Management should also consider an implementation of a Task Force specifically to assist with these functions and including the performance of purchasing functions in evaluations to ensure this area is properly monitored.	(1)	February 201 4 June 2015	Partially Completed	July 2013
3.	Insufficient controls in the collection process. OFS and SFS Branch policies and procedures should be updated and standardized policies and procedures should be created. Controls should be established within Meal Tracker. Consolidation features for Meal Tracker should be developed, mandatory training should be required, and periodic spot checks should be conducted. Management should also consider an implementation of a Task Force and include the performance of purchasing functions in evaluations.	(1)	July 2014	Partially Completed	

Completed

Partially Completed

Outstanding – Not Overdue

Outstanding - Overdue

Page 24



	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Sch	ool Food Services Review (continued)			School Food Servic	es Director
4.	Lack of current and comprehensive School Food Services purchasing policies and procedures. Policies and procedures should be updated. Management should create a new form or consider automation of inventory. Management should also review practicality of electronic inventory files, create policies and procedures for the new method of tracking inventory, and distribute the file. Mandatory training should be required.	(2)	July 2014	Partially Completed	July 2013
5.	Lack of technology in menu planning, ordering, and inventory. The DOE should consider the benefits of automating this process and interconnecting the menu planning, ordering, and inventory processes.	(2)	July 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	
6.	Required forms and supporting documentation are not completed and/or retained and procedures are often not followed. Mandatory training should be required for all staff handling school food collection and purchasing functions and periodic spot checks should be conducted. Management should consider an implementation of a Task Force and include the performance of collection and purchasing functions in evaluations.	(2)	July 2014	Partially Completed	July 2013
7.	The method of staffing school kitchens is not clearly defined and is prone to manipulation. Management should update the staffing calculation to reflect the current practice, document SFS Director's approval for unusual situations, train SFS Supervisors on how to apply the staffing formula, clearly communicate the results of the staffing formula to PROs, monitor the application of the staffing formula, and consider methods to reduce manipulation to the staffing formula.	(\mathbf{n})	July 2014	Partially Completed	
	Completed Partially Completed Outstanding –	Not Overd	ue Outst	anding - Overdue	Dage 25



The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous reports issued.

	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
	ual Hire Personnel Recruitment, Hiring & Payroll Processes Review, ued November 2012		Personnel	Management Bran	ch Director
1.	Lack of current and accessible casual hire personnel and casual payroll policies and procedures. Management should create new standardized policies, procedures, and forms and place them in a centrally located area for schools and offices to access. Policies and procedures should be revisited and updated as necessary. Training should be given to the field.	(2)	December 2012 February 2013	Completed	✓ April 2013
2.	Lack of oversight, monitoring and accountability at the school/office level. Management may consider: recentralizing the Casual Hire function and having the schools/offices only perform the Casual payroll function, requiring all casual hire employees to participate in the direct deposit program, creating standardized timesheets that require approval by supervisors. The DOE should also continue consideration of implementing the time clock project. Periodic monitoring/reviewing of the casual hiring and personnel forms by principals and Complex Area Business Managers (CABMs).	(1)	December 2012 – February 2013	Completed	✓ April 2013
3.	Lack of oversight, monitoring and accountability of the casual hire process. Management should create deadlines to allow OHR time to verify a casual hire employee before first day of employment. Management should consider automation of background checks. OHR should monitor if casual hires meet their Highly Qualified (HQ) paraprofessional requirements when required. Violation reports and consequences for violations should be used to encourage compliance.	(1)	January 2013 End of April 2013 (2nd Extension)	Completed	✓ June 2013

Completed

Partially Completed

Outstanding – Not Overdue

Outstanding - Overdue



The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous reports issued.

	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸	
Cas	sual Hire Personnel Recruitment, Hiring & Payroll Processes Review (continued)		Personnel Management Branch Director			
4.	Insufficient controls in the Casual Payroll System. The Casual Payroll System should: require additional approvals for historical edits and for entering differentials, be able to combine multiple positions for an employee and block the user from entering hours greater than the maximum weekly allowance, and also be able to enforce maximum weekly hours even if the week falls between two pay periods. Management should enforce a shorter time limit for entering historical edits and consider restricting access controls to limit who can make historical edits or differentials. Violation reports and consequences for violations should be used to encourage compliance.	(2)	December- 2012 August 2014 (2nd Extension)	Partially Completed	April 2013	
5.	Proper casual hire employee applications and supporting documents are not always submitted or retained. Management should create new standardized policies, procedures and forms and place them in a centrally located area for schools and offices to access. Policies and procedures should be revisited and updated as necessary. Training should be given to the field. Schools, offices, and OHR should ensure that Form I-9 is fully completed and is dated within three (3) years from the date hired prior to the start date of a casual hire employee.	(1)	December 2012 February 2013	Completed	✓ April 2013	

Со	mp	leted	
	· · · P		

Partially Completed

Outstanding – Not Overdue

Outstanding - Overdue

Page 27



	Audit Comment		Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸	
Pro	curement & Contracting Process Review, Issued July 2012			Procure ment Director		
1.	Lack of oversight, monitoring and accountability at the school/office level. Mandatory training required for all staff handling procurement functions, implementation of a Task Force specifically to assist schools and offices with the procurement function, periodic spot checks should be conducted by someone outside the schools/offices, administrators' review and approval, and implementation of evaluations to include procurement functions were recommended.	(1)	December 2012 December 2013 (2nd Extension)	Completed	✓ December 2013	
2.	Lack of oversight, monitoring and accountability of the P-Card Administration Office. Vendor Payment in conjunction with OHR to develop a system in which OHR notifies Vendor Payment whenever an employee terminates or transfers on a timely manner. Periodic reviews should be conducted by Vendor Payment to verify active P-Card holders.	(1)	December- 2012 April 2013	Completed	✓ April 2013	
3.	Lack of consequences and enforcement for violations of procurement procedures. Violations reports should be used as a tool to help schools/offices understand the policies and procedures that are in place. Management should consider setting guidelines that will result in the revocation of the cardholder's P-Card. Mandatory training and implementation of evaluations to include procurement functions were also recommended.	(1)	December- 2012 March 2013	Completed	✓ June 2013	

Completed	Partially Completed	Outstanding – Not Overdue	Outstanding - Overdue	
				Page 28



The following represents the status of IA observations and recommendations from previous reports issued.

Partially Completed

	Audit Comment		Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸	
Pro	curement & Contracting Process Review (continued)		Procurement Director			
4.	Proper forms and supporting documents are not always submitted. Procurement and Contracts Branch (PCB) may consider transferring the affidavit to the Purchasing Worksheet or combining the Form 10-B with the Purchasing Worksheet. Cardholder Agreements should be signed by the P-Card holder on an annual basis. Mandatory training, implementation of Task Force, periodic spot checks, administrators' review and approval, implementation of evaluations to include procurement functions, and guidelines set ups were also recommended.	(1)	December- 2012- December 2013 (2nd Extension)	Completed	✓ December 2013	
5.	Incorrect procurement method identified at the school/office level. Mandatory training, implementation of Task Force, periodic spot checks, administrators' review and approval, and implementation of evaluations were recommended.	(2)	December 2012 December 2013 (2nd Extension)	Completed	✓ December 2013	
6.	Procurement procedures are not always followed at the school/office level. Cardholder Agreements should be signed by the P-Card holder on an annual basis. Mandatory training, implementation of Task Force, periodic spot checks, administrators' review and approval, implementation of evaluations to include procurement functions, and guidelines set ups were also recommended.	(2)	December 2012 December 2013 (2nd Extension)	Completed	✓ December 2013	
7.	Procedures requiring the completion of forms serving similar purposes between offices/branches result in duplicated efforts. PCB should train schools/offices on the proper use of completing Form 10-B and Purchasing Worksheet and clarify that travel forms or computer request forms may not be substituted. Alternatively, PCB may consider allowing schools/offices to submit travel forms and computer request forms in place of the Form 10-B and Purchasing Worksheet.	(3)	March 2014 September 2014 (3rd Extension)	Partially Completed	March 2014	

Completed

Outstanding – Not Overdue

Page 29

Outstanding - Overdue



	Audit Comment	Audit Rating	Target Date	Status as Provided by Management	IA 🗸
Lea	we Data & Timekeeping Process Review, Issued March 2010			Accounti	ng Director
1.	Lack of current, accessible leave and administrative policies. Align leave policies and procedures with the Bargaining Unit (BU) agreements, summarize with the different leave accounting rules, and describe employee responsibilities. Ensure these policies and procedures are accessible to employees and all employees are notified of updates.	(1)	March 2014 December 2014 (3rd Extension)	Partially Completed	April 2013
2.	Lack of useful tools and processes to ensure success. OFS in conjunction with OHR develop a checklist for timekeepers that summarized the necessary tasks to be completed at each pay period.	(2)	June 2012	Completed	✓ April 2013
3.	Need for mandatory and effective Timekeeper training. Develop training for timekeepers that include but not limited to technical issues, clearly articulated roles, responsibilities, accountability, and reviews of complex processes. Training should be designed by representatives from OHR, Payroll, Office of Information Technology Services (OITS), and Leave Accounting to ensure methodologies are aligned.	(2)	June 2011	Completed	✓ April 2013
4.			May 2012	Completed	✓ April 2013
5.	Timekeeping system (T&A) not meeting certain business objectives. Develop proper controls to prevent issues related to a lack of system controls and improper segregation of duties.	(2)	New ERP System: 2014	Outstanding - Not Overdue	
	Completed Partially Completed Outstanding – No	t Overdue	Outstand	ing - Overdue	



	OBSERVATION RATING SCALE
High (1)	 1 - The impact of the finding is <u>material</u>¹ and the likelihood of loss is probable in one of the following ways: A material misstatement of the DOE's financial statements could occur; The DOE's business objectives, processes, financial results, or image could be materially impaired; The DOE may fail to comply with applicable laws, regulations, or contractual agreements, which could result in fines, sanctions, and/or liabilities that are material to the DOE's financial performance, operations, or image. Immediate action is recommended to mitigate the DOE's exposure.
Moderate (2)	 2 - The impact of the finding is <i>significant</i>¹ and the likelihood of loss is possible in one of the following ways: A significant misstatement of the DOE's financial statements could occur; The DOE's business objectives, processes, financial performance, or image could be notably impaired; The DOE may fail to comply with applicable laws, regulations, or contractual agreements, which could result in fines, sanctions and/or liabilities that are significant to the DOE's financial performance, operations or image. Corrective action by management should be prioritized and completed in a timely manner to mitigate any
Low (3)	risk exposure. 3 – The impact of the finding is moderate and the probability of an event resulting in loss is possible. Action is recommended to limit further deterioration of controls.

¹The application of these terms are consistent with the guidelines provided by the Institute of Internal Auditors.



Management Action Plan Completion Status

